

Bonni [00:00:00] On today's Teaching in Higher Ed episode number 79, I speak with Dr. Robin Paige about the potential impact of stereotype threat inside and outside our classrooms.

Production Credit [00:00:14] Produced by Innovate Learning, maximizing human potential.

Bonni [00:00:24] Welcome to this episode of Teaching in Higher Ed. This is the space where we explore the art and science of being more effective at facilitating learning. We also share ways to increase our personal productivity approaches. So we can have more peace in our lives and be even more present for our students.

Bonni [00:00:53] Today I welcome to the show Dr. Robin Paige. She received her doctorate in Development Sociology from Cornell University in 2008 and her research focuses on gender, migration, and alternative food systems in the U.S. and Mexico. Her current research is a qualitative study of women who remain behind their husbands as they migrate from Mexico to the U.S. and the social and emotional consequences for women during long periods of family separation.

Bonni [00:01:28] She works in the Rice Center for Teaching Excellence with Josh Eyer who is a former guest a few times now and she has an extensive background in service learning faculty development undergraduate education and curriculum and program development across the disciplines.

Bonni [00:01:48] Robin is the Assistant Director for the Center for Teaching Excellence and she has a diverse background in undergraduate education teaching at a wide variety of educational institutions from the community college, to land grant and private universities.

Bonni [00:02:06] Dr. Robin Paige, welcome to Teaching in Higher Ed. What is something that we should know about you to really understand who you are as a person?

Robin [00:02:15] Well one thing I think that I don't end up sharing with a lot of people that a lot of people at Rice University where I work know is that I actually live on campus with the students. Rice University is a residential college system which means majority of the students live on campus for at least three or four years.

Robin [00:02:38] And we have a loving residential colleges at Rice but the students were backing each residential college has a master and two residential associates and then three of those colleges have what are called Head resident fellows.

Robin [00:02:57] Which means that they're essentially bigger colleges so they needed a few more people to live on campus. And so masters have resident fellows residential associates are our faculty who live with the students in these colleges interact with them eat with them you know have a very kind of informal as well as formal relationship with them. So my partner myself are on a 9 month old daughter who lives in the dorm with about 300 students.

Bonni [00:03:30] This is really fascinating to me as someone who has taught now 10 years in undergrad. That doesn't sound really appealing to me. What was it about that sounded appealing to you and your partner.

Robin [00:03:44] It didn't really sound appealing to me. I found it appealing to my mom my partner I think because he liked the idea of having three free meals a day I'll probably kill me for saying that after I had been here for a year because I didn't I never lived on campus as an undergraduate. I lived off campus the whole time.

Robin [00:04:06] And so I'd never lived on campus so the idea of living on campus as a non student was really scary for me. But after being here for a year and getting to understand what a residential college system was and being able to have that kind of informal outside of the class relationships with students was really appealing to me.

Robin [00:04:27] And so I kind of had to be convinced myself that being here for a year really convinced me and this is our third year living on campus. So so far we've really enjoyed it.

Bonni [00:04:37] I'm so glad that you accepted the invitation to come on the show and I'll say upfront that it's been now more than a year that I've been doing the podcast about a year and a half and I certainly have felt remiss that this is the first direct head on time we're having an episode about something related to race and ethnicity.

Bonni [00:04:58] And I have felt apprehensive about just exactly how do you unpack this because you can't certainly fit it into an episode. And Josh Eyler who's been on the show a couple of times before he recommended both the subject of stereotype threat and also yourself to come on the show and I'm so glad that we are doing this today.

Bonni [00:05:19] But for people listening I want them to know that it's just the start of what I hope to be a much lengthier conversation and to begin with if you could just share what is the definition of stereotype threat. And then we can begin to unpack it and look at some of the research.

Robin [00:05:36] Okay great. Yeah I think this is I'm really impressed that you're doing this podcast and I think it's a really important issue and this is a really great time to be talking about it because of what's going on in campuses across the US regarding race from campus culture right now as well as you know right now the Supreme Court hearing the UT Austin case so I think this is a great time to start talking about these things in higher education.

Robin [00:06:03] So the term stereotype threat was coined by Claude Steele and Joshua Aronson in their 1995 paper that was in the Journal of Personality and Social Psychology. I'm pretty sure.

Robin [00:06:17] And so it's a definition that I think is really good that comes from steel is when a person's identity has a negative stereotype attached to it and that person engages in important activities that are relevant to that stereotype.

Robin [00:06:34] Some key points of that definition are that the identity has to be salient to the person. So there could be stereotypes about an identity that that person has or that somebody else can sign on to that person. But if it isn't salient for them then that stereotype threat isn't likely to be present.

Robin [00:06:53] And then the domain or the activity that is important regarding that stereotype also has to be important to the person. And there has to be a negative association with that identity or in some cases maybe we'll have a

chance to talk about a little later a positive identity can also have had an effect in that situation.

Robin [00:07:18] So the key is really I think it brings it back to the individual it has to be something that's salient to them and it has to be an activity or it doesn't mean it's really important to them.

Bonni [00:07:29] I know you mentioned that there are positive aspects of stereotype threat but but most of the research I believe is on the more negative aspects to it is that correct. Correct assumption to make.

Robin [00:07:41] Yeah negative impact that it can have mostly on most of the research is on the negative impact it can have on an assessment of learning. And then there's some research that points to that it can actually impact learning itself. So those distinctions are definitely made. Or is that impacting the learning or is it impacting the assessment and the learning then we can ask the question is it impacting both what they would call a double jeopardy.

Bonni [00:08:10] So let's go through an example then and let's start with a negative impact example and maybe walk us through stereotype threat for a particular made up person. What would it look like for a person.

Robin [00:08:25] So for example I think a really good example would be women in math. Right. So there's a stereotype that exists in our society in our culture that women aren't as good at math as men are. And so if a woman is entering into let's use that assessment because that's what most of the research has been done on a math test carrying that knowledge that know the person who's giving the best test the person who's going to grade this test doesn't think I'm as good likely that.

Robin [00:09:01] Because I'm a woman I will be as good as a male in doing math that that'll create some form of anxiety and added anxiety right because most tests take mood as anxious for people and so for this for this woman young woman going in and taking the test having that added anxiety. I'm not expected to do well because I'm a woman.

Robin [00:09:26] The research points to it in passing a working memory that they're dealing with this kind of anxiety the kind of mental psychological work of the stereotype is taking away from their ability to perform on the exam.

Robin [00:09:45] So there we have the identity that salient a woman and then the domain is taking a math test. Now what's interesting is the research points to it has stereotype has a much bigger impact for those that strongly identify with domains.

Robin [00:10:03] So if it's a young woman coming in who sees herself as a mathematician who highly values her math skills it will have a greater negative impact on her performance than if she was just kind of like wow you know I've heard that women don't do as well as math but I'm not really a math person I'm in the humanities. So those who strongly identify with that don't mean are going to have a strong negative impact.

Bonni [00:10:35] And that I'm I'm I'm just trying to apply your example to things I can think about. I think I oftentimes hear from people who are business majors and young women who are business majors who say I'm not good at math but would that be because they want to be a business major which they perceive as requiring those math skills on them not having it.

Bonni [00:10:58] Or maybe the parents are pressuring them to be a business major. Is that where the added stress would come in because that that being a business major is important to them.

Robin [00:11:08] Would more be the idea that could be a business major they have to be good at math right. So I think it would be I guess it would be in the sense you're saying they strongly identify with being a business major math skills are required that girl women are good at math and that would be something yes that would have a strong odor. What is shown to have a stronger negative effect on their performance.

Bonni [00:11:35] Yeah that's certainly something I see and I've I've not seen it associated with stereotype threat and maybe it's just because I haven't done my reading as much as I should.

Bonni [00:11:44] But the idea that in other countries especially in some Asian countries the opposite is told to our young people we tell the little girls how great they are at math and we tell the little boys that they're not good at math.

Bonni [00:11:56] And of course the opposite of what we see here in in America ends up being true for them. And so I tell that story sometimes to my students that gosh you think that you're not good. And they oftentimes believe that

women are worse at math than men and so the whole I can see the whole stereotype threat playing out for them for sure.

Robin [00:12:19] And one of the key findings with stereotype threat is what they call the priming as a stereotype. So for example it's in keeping with the example of women and math if women are given when you know if they go into a test and they ask at the beginning of the test to identify some demographic information write your name your age your major your gender if their primes in their ask their gender then they'll perform worse on that assessment then if there was no you know bubble or question of fill in your gender.

Robin [00:12:57] So the priming of those identities is what they've been able to show with research. It's also very key. And with your example it reminded me of some recent research where they actually talk about what they call a stereotype boost.

Robin [00:13:14] So this is kind of one of the positive effects. Hard to say that positive effect stereotype threat is they had young women young Asian women taking Asian American women taking a math assessment.

Robin [00:13:29] And when they prime them for their race and ethnicity they performed better on their assessment when they prime them for the gender they performed worse. So because there's a stereotype that Asian Americans are better at math that positive stereotypes had a boost for their performance.

Robin [00:13:53] But then when they turned around and primed them for the negative stereotypes that women are good at and that it had a negative effect on their performance. So that's where they were to show kind of the stereotypes.

Robin [00:14:06] So I because I'm a sociologist I always think it's really important to point out things are much more complicated so even though there might be a stereotype what we would call like a positive stereotype which Asian Americans had the model minority stereotype the stereotype in the case of Marafa that they're better at math that back in a really negative consequences in general for Asian American students.

Robin [00:14:33] They've shown in studies that Asian American students are less likely to receive help from their teachers and teachers are less likely to approach students in math class. Asian American students in math classes to see if they need assistance so that positive stereotypes can actually have a navy effect on learning.

Robin [00:14:55] Now that's separate from the stereotype threat but I always think it's good to kind of think about this contextually it's not you know maybe causing a boost in one situation but not in another.

Bonni [00:15:07] Yeah I can picture I have of course I try to think frequently about people that listen to the show and I could see the criticism potentially being exactly the complexity that you just talked about we're certainly not saying that this is the ticket and if we could just solve this one thing everyone's going to do better on their learning outcomes and then the yeah yes.

Bonni [00:15:26] The other thing I appreciate that's underline what what you're saying is that we all are capable of this whether or not we're cognisant of it and I have mentioned before on the show but I'll say it again I use an attendance app on my iPhone and one of the things I use it for most is to randomly call on students and I know that I would. I'd like to think ideally that I wouldn't have stereotypes that would ever play out in the classroom.

Bonni [00:15:57] And I think the first thing we can do to become better at helping all of our students in the classroom is recognize we would have weak points in our teaching and bias. We're not even aware of and having something that randomly calls on people would certainly help with that.

Bonni [00:16:14] Could we do another example of stereotype threat research that might help us round out beyond the issues of men versus women but perhaps on some of the the race and ethnicity.

Robin [00:16:29] Yeah definitely I think the original paper by Steele and Aronson is a really good example because it brings up some of the things we haven't had a chance to to talk about yet.

Robin [00:16:40] So they gave a verbal test they introduced a verbal test as a diagnostic of ability that correlated or corrected for with S.A.T. scores and they found that the black students tended to form worse than the white students and that was when the test was introduced as a diagnostic test.

Robin [00:17:03] So diagnostic of ability. And so that's also a really key point where stereotype threat is that when something is seen as determining ability or intelligence or kind of proving something as opposed to an assessment that might be about improving learning. So proving learning versus improving learning that it had an impact on the verbal test so that was the original study.

Bonni [00:17:36] Could you talk a little bit more about the proven versus improving learning distinction.

Robin [00:17:42] So for example we can provide a lot of assignments or quizzes. So like typical or standard tests and quizzes in classes where we communicate to students that the feedback on these is more about improving your learning. Right.

Robin [00:18:01] So when we give students the impression that there is kind of no extra level of intelligence that students can improve and they can learn that that has a very different impact. And when students are given a diagnostic test or this is where you're going to prove that you've learned something or proved how intelligent you are.

Robin [00:18:30] So one of the things I was going to mention about kind of interventions is we're talking about this is communicating to students about the idea which is really popular right now in kind of the mind set discussion of having a fixed intelligence versus a plastic or kind of malleable intelligence.

Robin [00:18:52] So communicating to students that idea has been shown as one of the ways of the kind of interventions that can work against stereotype threat in the classroom. Most of the early research on stereotype threat was about these kind of assessments as being diagnostic.

Robin [00:19:14] And so a lot of those studies showed that just taking away or having what is changing in that experiment is just a diagnostic assessment or is this just an activity had a great impact on student performance.

Bonni [00:19:31] Is part of what you are suggesting that we could do more of the low stakes or no stakes assessment along the way in our classes and be very very purposeful in explaining that these are designed to help improve your learning not necessarily prove to me what you know. Am I getting that part of it correct.

Robin [00:19:51] Yes yes. That a lot of the assessment is for feedback to help students improve their learning because communicating to students that learning is an intelligence is something that you know to have kind of that growth mindset that talks about that we can improve that it's not coming into a class or coming into an assessment meeting to prove points. Intelligence as if it's a static thing.

Bonni [00:20:21] Yeah. What are some of the criticisms that people have had of Steeles research about or perhaps even broader stereotype threat research in general.

Robin [00:20:31] I think while there's there's criticisms of kind of the different ways obviously in the research that the experiments are done which is kind of outside of my expertise because I'm not a psychologist they don't do experimental methodology.

Robin [00:20:49] But I would say one of the biggest criticisms and Setele is actually talked about this himself is the idea that it can perpetuate a kind of. Well it's all in your head. All you have to do is just not believe the stereotypes. I would say is one of the main criticisms of it is that if we house students well OK there's a stereotype in society that let's say women aren't good at math or African-Americans aren't as good in higher education as white students then they just need to change their mindset.

Robin [00:21:30] So it puts it back on to the individual student right that it's a problem of the individual student and it's a problem of perception as opposed to a problem kind of in the larger context of our society but definitely in higher education as well as within the classroom.

Robin [00:21:49] So I would say that is one of the the main criticisms. Another criticism would be that the idea. That we need to understand that racism is real. So there's a difference between a perceived threat for some and real racism that exists on a daily basis for many people in our society.

Robin [00:22:17] And I think one of the in his book Whistling Vivaldi, Claude Steele talks about a few examples. One example is as a black man who ended up becoming a New York Times journalist and he talks about kind of his ability to alter what he calls alter public space in that just as a young black man moving through social space.

Robin [00:22:44] People may avoid him or move you know to the other side of the street or fear going in an elevator with him. And that that's a daily experience for him and that's part of what he grew up with as a as a stereotype threat.

Robin [00:22:57] But it was you know pervasive in his life not just within education. And then he talks about another example of a young white student in a college classroom on African-American history and how the stereotypes that you know

he he doesn't know what it is to experience race in American society impacted his ability to learn in that classroom.

Robin [00:23:24] And the criticism there would be that you know those are vastly different experiences of race in our society. So the consequences of not being able to do well in one class because of stereotype threat versus having it be a pervasive aspect of your life had very different consequences and both just in one's life but also in one's experience going through higher education. So I would say those are kind of two main criticisms of the concept of stereotype threat.

Bonni [00:23:57] Robin you're talking about that sort of reminds me why I have been somewhat reluctant to even talk about issues of race and ethnic ethnicity on the class previously because it does feel like this is just one slice of such a larger picture.

Bonni [00:24:12] And I appreciate how you've articulated that in terms of. Nice to know actually that he has articulated that those concerns about his own research. That sounds like a powerful read. I've not read that book before.

Bonni [00:24:25] In the introduction Robin you shared that you not only have experience in the classroom teaching our students but also outside the classroom. And I wonder if you could share a bit about some of the issues of stereotype threat that you see happening outside the classroom.

Robin [00:24:42] Issues that students have brought to me. I would say that in the three years that I've lived on campus with students is a campus culture that is afraid to really bring up issues of race and racism on campus and create ten of them.

Robin [00:25:04] The idea of a colorblind society and how damaging that can be for students of color on campus when they feel that the pressure to be colorblind means that they are experiences that they have that are that are very real that can impact just their quality of life as human beings but also their ability to do well in their college careers.

Robin [00:25:31] That if we don't talk about those issues if we don't bring them to the forefront it's very hard to do that because nobody wants to talk about you know race and inequality and nobody wants or even you know gender inequality going beyond just the race issue and that if we don't talk about those

and were not really honest with ourselves about those then it's really hard to address a lot of these issues.

Robin [00:25:56] And so even you know from the classroom as as a teacher in the class right those are are hard things that we ourselves need to look at when when we're teaching our classes is you know who's not only what are my interactions with students like but you know who's who's being represented here in the classroom.

Robin [00:26:17] Am I making my class as inclusive as possible. And maybe I maybe there's things I'm missing that I don't know about and I need to expand my horizons to kind of know what inclusive city looks like.

Robin [00:26:33] So I think both that the campus culture like a classroom culture really needs to be upfront and honest with discussing race and kind of the difficult feelings about it. And I think a lot of campuses are trying to do that right now.

Robin [00:26:52] When I see what's going on and reading about what's going on and some other college campuses and trying to bring these issues into discussion of as colleges or universities is that students of color are often left to be the ones to say you know we need to talk about these issues.

Robin [00:27:13] And so it's not this is any kind of putting on a sociologist hat right now but I think we all we all need to realize that you know race is something that defines all of us that there's many of us who are race free or race neutral that you know being white is also a racial construction and so kind of being able to see all of ourselves and part of that conversation is really important.

Robin [00:27:43] And when I taught race and ethnicity that is often how I would start my first day of classes I would say you know well you know you're probably looking at me thinking What is this white woman have to tell me about race. And then I would talk about well you know white has a racial category is also socially constructed. And you know I'm part of I'm part of this process too.

Robin [00:28:11] And so I think that's one of the things when we're thinking about stereotype threat that for students if they feel that you know that these stereotypes are pervasive in their lives that they're part of their experience as students that to have a space to talk about it instead of having a space that says well we don't really talk about those things because we don't see race as a

problem on our campus can really be something that doesn't provide a space for students to talk about race.

Robin [00:28:45] And that's one thing I've heard living among students is not feeling that they can really talk about their own experiences. Sometimes on campus culture is where people want to believe that we live in a colorblind society.

Robin [00:29:02] And one of the things that we can do either on our campuses or in the classroom is create a space of accountability with out you know saying you're a bad person for thinking that if we we open up a space for students can talk about race or talk about gender in a way where they say well someone can turn around and say Wait whoa you know what you just said it really bothered me in these ways and see it as a learning experience as opposed to what I said that that means I'm a horrible person.

Robin [00:29:40] I think those are the best ways in our classrooms or on the campus or just sitting and having lunch with a student or just another person. The thing that has to be in an educational context is to kind of have you know you can be accountable for your ideas. But we also have to see that ideas and beliefs can change.

Robin [00:29:59] You know that that students can kind of work through those things and be able to see opposing ideas or challenges to their ideas in ways that are coolness entirely threatening.

Robin [00:30:14] One thing I was going to mention we're as we're kind of talking about talking to students about these things being transparent or giving students spaces to talk about race and ethnicity or gender inequality is we do have to be careful.

Robin [00:30:30] One thing I've observed in my own teaching is that talking about inequality because sociologists do a lot of that in classrooms can't actually be a priming for students.

Robin [00:30:45] So I have spent most of my time in higher education teaching at the Community College. And I worked at a community college that was a labeled as a Hispanic serving institution.

Robin [00:31:01] The majority of our students were first generation students to college second generation students in the United States. And Latino students

and I would often in my recent ethnicity classes I found it really important to talk about student education and a lot of the inequality that they experience in a lot of their field to access.

Robin [00:31:23] And what I found is that in the beginning students had kind of sigh of relief like oh I thought it was all me I thought I was the one who was succeeding but now I realized that there were all these kind of obstacles.

Robin [00:31:38] You know they didn't absolve themselves of individual responsibility but they said Oh there's some other things going on here that might have made it difficult for me when pursuing a college education. But I also found that as a course went on students would start to say things like what's the point.

Robin [00:31:56] It's always this there's always obstacles they start to get really apathetic and you know and as a young teacher that was exactly the opposite of what I wanted to do for them.

Robin [00:32:07] So there has to be I learned there. There has to be a balance of kind of teaching about inequalities in a way that shows students of the complexity of our society. But at the same time doesn't become a means of moving students towards kind of apathy and her kind of. So what's the point attitude.

Robin [00:32:32] So that's one thing I really learned through working with students and in kind of knowing more about stereotype threat both in the classroom but also I think that's something you can think about outside of the classroom just on their own campuses.

Bonni [00:32:49] Well this is the point in this show in which we shift over and do recommendations and I'm going to give my real quick and then pass the ball back over to you. I have two quick recommendations one is very related to what we've discussed today.

Bonni [00:33:02] There was a recent episode of This American Life it was number 573 and I will link to it in the show notes. And it was called Status Update and the two stories that especially stand out to me. One is about young teenage girls that are talking about their communication on Instagram and it was like speaking to very young linguists about this whole set of proper ways that you're supposed to tell the other young woman how beautiful she is.

Bonni [00:33:33] And what she's supposed to say back and how if you don't like it but you comment what that means and it was just a fascinating look at a language that is completely incomprehensible to me but was fun to see through these young women's eyes.

Bonni [00:33:45] And on that same episode there was a conversation because we were talking about race and ethnicity. And many of you might have heard of Ta-Nehisi Coates who has written a very powerful book a letter to his son.

Bonni [00:33:59] But it's a conversation with him and a friend of his who is a producer for This American Life named Neil Drumming. And they're talking a little bit about how fame has changed their friendship and wealth has changed their friendship and was just a delightful conversation to look at the complexities involved with their shared past. And then how life has changed a bit for him as he has become so famous. It was really a fun a fun listen and then to think about their friendship. And what do you have Robin to recommend for us today.

Robin [00:34:34] Well the first thing I would recommend is like I mentioned earlier the withdrawal of all the book if anybody's interested in looking a little more into the stereotype threat.

Robin [00:34:45] The other thing that I think if anybody's thinking how I talk about some of these issues in the classroom my great blog is called Sociological Images and it has a diversity of sociological themes but there's a lot on race and ethnicity and it deals with a lot in the popular media.

Robin [00:35:05] And then the third thing I have three recommendations is to kind of create what I would call a stereotype safe environment in your classroom is the first thing to do would just be to create a great environment in your class.

Robin [00:35:22] And the thing I suggest for that is food pie. It has a young Sociologist as a young female sociologist I often resisted bringing food into the classroom because I didn't want to reinforce the stereotype of you know kind of the caretaker woman bringing food to care for her students.

Robin [00:35:43] But I do teach a class on the sociology of food and this semester I had students we have food. Every single class period I had the students bring some food that was related to the reading for that week and having food across the entire semester and in every class period just created this

very kind of relaxed and engaging environment it gave something a common experience for students there.

Robin [00:36:13] They're all eating the same food so again students who might not otherwise talk to each other gave them something in common to talk about and then just start you know expanding from there.

Robin [00:36:24] And so I think that you know it's a great way and you can always put it on to students that they bring it every week. But I think that's a great way to start creating kind of community in the classroom and moving towards one of these environments where some of these kind of barriers and stereotypes start to get broken down a little bit.

Bonni [00:36:43] Oh that's wonderful. Thank you so much for the recommendations. And Robin, I also want to just thank you again for investing your time I know it's so precious especially this time of the year and with a little when and with your students I just really appreciate you investing the time to contribute to all the people who are looking to improve our teaching.

Robin [00:37:02] Yeah great. Thanks so much for having me. I really enjoyed talking to you and the whole conversation.

Bonni [00:37:08] Thanks once again to Robin for joining me on the show and I realized I said I had two recommendations on I only mentioned the This American Life episode.

Bonni [00:37:17] My second recommendation is actually not mine it's from Dave Stachowiak who you may have met on prior episodes. He has taught in higher ed and also happens to be married to me and he is recommending a course that he has now gone through for three years.

Bonni [00:37:33] It's put out by Michael Hyatt and it's called Five days to your best year ever. It's an online course. And again he's done it prior to this year and will be doing it again this year and has really found it to be a wonderful framework for planning out what's important to him in the year to come and how to execute on those things that are most important.

Bonni [00:37:55] And I will say in advance we do have a referral link but it is not one of those things we're trying to make money off of you for something we wouldn't pay for ourselves it is a course again that Dave's been through for three years and will be paying for and doing again this year.

Bonni [00:38:10] But if you're interested you can go to coachingforleaders.com/best2016. Again that was coachingforleaders.com/best2016 and I will have a link to that in the show notes under the recommendations in case you are in your car or walk around your lake right now and don't have time to write it down.

Bonni [00:38:35] Thanks once again for listening to this episode of Teaching in Higher Ed. If you would like to read about the articles and other resources that Robin and I mentioned on this episode. You can do so at teachinginhighered.com/79 and you have yet to subscribe to the weekly update.

Bonni [00:38:55] That's a great way to get all of those links automatically in your inbox each week along with on most weeks an article about either teaching or productivity and you can do that at teachinginhighered.com/subscribe and I always welcome your feedback. You can do that on Twitter I'm @Bonni208 and loved to connect with so many of you there or it teachinginhighered.com/feedback. Thanks so much for listening and I'll see you next time.

Teaching in Higher Ed transcripts are created using a combination of an automated transcription service and human beings. This text likely will not represent the precise, word-for-word conversation that was had. The accuracy of the transcripts will vary. The authoritative record of the Teaching in Higher Ed podcasts is contained in the audio file.